

NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

SCRUTINY OF HEALTH COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held at Hambleton District Council, The Council Chamber, Civic Cross, Stonecross, Northallerton on 8 July 2010.

PRESENT:-

County Councillor Gareth Dadd in the Chair.

County Councillors:- Val Arnold, Andrew Backhouse, John Blackie, Margaret-Ann de Courcey-Bayley (substitute for Keith Barnes), Margaret Hulme, Shelagh Marshall and Heather Moohouse.

District Councillors Members: - Helen Firth (Craven), Ian Galloway (Harrogate), Rob Johnson (Richmondshire) and Eileen Vickers (Scarborough).

Officers: Bryon Hunter (Scrutiny Support), Jane Wilkinson (Legal and Democratic Services) and Derek Law, Seamus Breen and Larry Hollando (Adult & Community Services).

Present by Invitation: Sue Metcalfe, Amanda Brown, Alison Woodhouse Becky Case and Grahame Dickinson (NHS North Yorkshire and York), Janet Probert (Managing Director of Community and Mental Health Services (C&MHS) and Leo McGrory (NYLINK).

In attendance:- County Councillors Bernard Bateman, Tony Hall and Melva Steckles and District Councillor John Clark (Ryedale).

Apologies for absence were received from County Councillors Keith Barnes and Andrew Williams and Ruth Sayner (Selby) and Shirley Shepherd (Hambleton).

COPIES OF ALL DOCUMENTS CONSIDERED ARE IN THE MINUTE BOOK

38. MINUTES

That the Minutes of the meeting held on 18 June 2010 to be taken as read and be confirmed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

39. PUBLIC QUESTIONS OR STATEMENTS

The Committee was advised that no notice had been received of any public questions or statements to be made at the meeting.

40. TRANSFORMING COMMUNITY SERVICES

CONSIDERED –

Reports from NHS North Yorkshire & York PCT and the Corporate Director – Adult & Community Services on the national initiative Transforming Community Services whereby primary care trusts must divest themselves of their provider function by 31 March 2011.

As a first step towards implementing Transforming Community Services the Primary Care Trust had set up its provider arm Community and Mental Health Services

(C&MHS) as an arms length organisation, from 1 April 2009. The Committee heard that the Primary Care Trust was now in the process of seeking expressions of interest from local acute trusts to take over the services currently provided by C&MHS.

Sue Metcalfe, Deputy Chief Executive of NHS NY&Y addressed the meeting and described the assurance process the PCT had followed examining a number of options and how and why the PCT had made the decision to progress vertical integration with acute trusts.

Derek Law, (Corporate Director – Adult & Community Services) and Seamus Breen (Assistant Director (Commissioning and Partnerships) also attended and gave their perspective on the proposals. In particular they drew Members attention to the Revision to the NHS Operating Framework issued on 21 June 2010.

Members accepted that Transforming Community Services was a national initiative but expressed their disappointment that the option of having one county wide provider of community services had been ruled out. Members considered that the transfer of the service to four trusts would undermine the work that had been undertaken in recent years to integrate health and social care and could lead to inequity across the County which would place an additional burden on the County Council in terms of partnership working.

Members agreed that who provided community services was not the key issue. Rather that more thought needed to be given to how providers are to be commissioned to deliver services including how they are commissioned to work with the County Council. The development of a County-wide commissioning framework would ensure that community services were delivered in an integrated way with social care and that there was equity in terms of access and outcomes across the entire County.

RESOLVED –

- (a) Thanked Sue Metcalfe, (Deputy Chief Executive, NHS NY&Y) and her colleagues for briefing the Committee on how Transforming Community Services was being taken forward across North Yorkshire and thanked Derek Law and Seamus Breen for giving their perspective on the proposals.
- (b) Expressed disappointment that the option of seeking a countywide provider of community services and mental health services had been ruled out.
- (c) That the current proposals could lead to a fragmented approach across the County in terms of service delivery and would place additional demands on the County Council in terms of partnership working.
- (d) Accepted that the most important aspect of any future arrangements is not who or how many providers there are, but rather how they are commissioned to deliver services and to work with the County Council in a consistent and integrated way.
- (e) Urges NHS NY&Y before its Board meeting on 26 October 2010 to:
 - (i) work closely with the County Council in the development of a County-wide commissioning framework which ensures that community services are delivered in an integrated way with social care and there is equity in terms of access and outcomes across all of the County, and

- (ii) be informed by the framework above, and in accordance with the recently published NHS Revised Operating Framework to test its proposals with local authorities and GP commissioners.
- (f) That an update report on Transforming Community Services be referred to this Committee at an appropriate time.

41. MINOR INJURY SERVICES IN RICHMONDSHIRE AND HAMBLETON

CONSIDERED –

The report of NHS North Yorkshire & York describing how it planned to engage with key stakeholders and the public on proposals to close the minor injuries units at the Friary Hospital in Richmond, the Lambert Hospital in Thirsk and St Monica's Hospital in Easingwold.

The Chairman invited Members to limit their comments to the proposed approach to public engagement, as set out in appendix 1 of the report. Members would be given the opportunity to scrutinise the substantive issues at either the meeting of the Committee on 21 September 2010 or at a special meeting on a date yet to be agreed.

The Committee was advised that the consultation would take place over a 12 week period starting in mid July. The dates of the meetings referred to in Appendix 1 had still to be agreed and assurances were given that the results of the consultation would be reported back to the Committee in due course.

County Councillor Melva Steckles said that not all parish councils within the boundary of Catterick Garrison were included in Appendix 1 and requested that this was rectified. Representatives of the PCT agreed to her request.

Members urged NHS NY&Y to confirm the dates of local meetings as soon as possible so that local Members could put the dates in their diaries.

Subject to the amendment made by County Councillor Melva Steckles Members expressed their support for the proposed engagement plan which they said was both thorough and flexible.

The Chairman sought assurances from the PCT that the existing minor injuries service at the three affected sites was in the intervening period safe. Janet Probert responded saying the nurses in the community hospitals who provided the service were very competent but lacked the full range of skills you would expect from a minor injuries practitioner. The service provided whilst safe was not a comprehensive minor injuries service.

RESOLVED –

That Amanda Brown and Janet Probert be thanked for their attendance and the information they provided to the Committee.

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee endorses the PCT's engagement plan for minor injuries in the Thirsk, Easingwold and Richmond area subject to the amendment suggested by County Councillor Melva Seckles during the meeting.

That the Scrutiny of Health Committee will review the results of the engagement plan and proposed closure of the three units at its meeting on 24 September 2010.

42. PROPOSED RELOCATION OF THE DENTAL CLINIC COVERING THE HARROGATE BOROUGH AREA

District Councillor Ian Galloway declared a personal interest in this item as a member of Harrogate Foundation Trust.

CONSIDERED –

The report of the Head of Scrutiny and Corporate Performance seeking Members comments on the proposed relocation of the dental clinic that provides specialist care for children, adults and older people with additional needs such as learning and physical disability from Ripon Community Hospital to Kingswood House in Harrogate.

A full explanation of the reasons for the proposed transfer of service as set out in the appendix to the report was given by Alison Woodhouse and Becky Case. It was stressed to the Committee that the existing service was not specific to Ripon but that it served the whole of the Harrogate area. The Committee was advised that if the service was transferred to Harrogate then the facilities at the new premises would provide existing patients with an increased range of treatment options and appointments. The transfer would also allow more people to receive treatment as the facilities in Ripon meant that the special needs of some patients were unable to be met.

The Committee was advised that the proposals had been discussed with all existing patients on an individual basis. Patients had been given of choice of transferring to the new Harrogate clinic (travel expenses would be paid), receiving treatment in their own homes or at Northallerton or transferring to general dental practice. Assurances were given to the Committee that the needs of all patients had been satisfied. In response to questions from Members the Committee noted that Kingswood House had ample free car parking and that transport would be arranged for existing patients if required.

Members commended the PCT on the manner and depth upon which they had engaged with users of the clinic and had worked hard to ensure concerns were answered and dealt with in a sympathetic manner.

Lead Members of the Committee also expressed their gratitude for their early engagement in the process during the election period which had been effective in preventing misleading stories and information being circulated.

Local Members said they were concerned about reduced services and ultimately the threat to the viability of Ripon Community Hospital if the dental clinic did transfer to Harrogate. NHSNY&Y informed the Committee that they had a number of competing bids from services using other premises in the Ripon area to use the space vacated by the transfer of the dental clinic at Ripon Hospital. This news was welcomed by Members who were keen to ensure that Ripon Community Hospital remained a viable facility. It was agreed that details of the services competing for the space would be circulated to Members following the meeting. In the light of the concerns expressed by local Members the Committee resolved to examine the role of Ripon Community Hospital and other similar hospitals across the Country in the near future.

RESOLVED –

The Scrutiny of Health Committee thanks Alison Woodhouse and Becky Case for their attendance and for briefing Members.

The Scrutiny of Health Committee acknowledges that NHSNY&Y has consulted and engaged with existing patients and has taken measures to facilitate their transfer to the new service.

The Scrutiny of Health Committee fully recognises the capital investment necessary to upgrade the existing facility and premises and offers no objection to the transfer.

That in the light of this development and wider issues around Transforming Community Services the Scrutiny of Health Committee holds a workshop during the autumn on the long term vision for community services and community hospitals in the County.

JW/ALJ